## Safe and Inclusive Cities Research Report Back Workshops

Unearthing Exclusions: Towards More Inclusive Zimbabwean Cities
HARARE

Research sites – Mbare (MB), Hatcliffe(HT)

Post Initial Scoping - Dialogue Sessions

	Individuals	Mechanisms	Inclusive Cities Implications	policies and evident gaps	continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
1. Housing, shelter, life conditions, overall welfare and general environment	Shortage of suitable municipal/government developed accommodation for increased population  Respondents in Mbare's perception of the provision of accommodation for men was that before independence it was systematic - before marriage it was single quarters (Matapi) - Mahosteri. On proof of marriage slightly larger accommodation was provided eg at Majubeki  Lifting urban migration restrictions post 1980 with little infrastructural development resulted in extreme overcrowding  Preliminary assessment of structures - many are dilapidated and unsafe (MB)  Homelessness /stress/ Poor mental health (MB)	People maximizing use of available space; lodgers and sub tenants,  Unintended and un catered for residents (MB)  People utilising any available space  Divide rooms with curtains to accommodate multiple families or individuals  Raise their beds to create a sleeping space for children and other relatives  Children sleep outside or on the street  Some sleeping in halls eg Mai Musodzi Hall Some sleep in the open areas eg the one near Mupedzanhamo and in between the blocks of flats.	Increased illegal accommodation,  Non compliance with municipal by-laws  Over population leading to overburdening of infrastructure and services  Child exposure to sex at a very tender age  Early marriages by girls to older men and unwanted pregnancies, Young men/boys in short term relationships with older women for food and accommodation  Increase in petty crime  Male , mostly ,departures to neighboring countries	Urban Councils Act housing policy at National and Municipal level, MDGs  GAPS Lack of knowledge of the law, lack of implementation either due to lack of political will or resources. Lack of accountability.  General frustration with the current situation  General apathy /resignation  The demarcation of Hatcliffe is difficult to establish as it appears to consist of: Reasonably adequate single family housing units: Core houses for further development by owners:	Same accommodation as in the colonial era with total different usage and pressures (RI) Thus there is overcrowding, lack of inspection and attention to maintain standards Housing low down on list of priorities for attention	S28 National Objective on Shelter  S51 Right to human dignity,  S52(a)Right to personal security, freedom from all forms of violence from public and private sources,  S57 Right to privacy  S81Rights of children (e) protection from sexual exploitation (f) to education, health care, nutrition and shelter	The initial scoping in Mbare was incomplete and we will have to revisit it. So far we have only managed to do the scoping in the Hostels namely Matapi, Majubeki and Matererini  What is the origin of street families and street children.  Gendered breakdown of institutional/government housing list?  Is there corruption, conscious ignoring or flouting of by laws or 'forced' subsidization of services  How are residents consulted and who are the consulted residents  The origins of Hetcliffe need to be explored through desk research and probably deed registry searches

**Evidence of** 

Frameworks

**Queries Audience** 

**Exclusions** 

Impact on

Coping

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Mechanisms	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Queries Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
1. (Continued) Housing, shelter, life conditions, overall welfare and general environment	Lack of formal transfer creating tensions within families over occupation and inheritance rights.(MB)  People who were living in the Matapi flats that were gutted by fire were "temporarily" accommodated in municipal halls since 2009.  In Hatcliffe a significant number of families are living in a constant state of uncertainty as they are unable to obtain proof of occupation and some in Hetcliffe extention have been told they could be moved any time as the land has been sold to private developers.	People who were living in the flats that were gutted by fire have had to live in the city halls, dividing living spaces amongst the families using cardboard boxes and curtains  Girls leave/persuaded to marry early so that they move out  Three + generational occupation	Apparent lack of state/municipal resources to improve access to socio economic rights  Sexual violence and harrassment for women and girls.  Young children exposed to inappropriate sexual stimulus	In Hatcliff Extension there are cabins shacks tents and other forms of temporary shelter some of which have been there for more than 10 years.			What is the status of their occupation of the spaces or stands.  We still have queries on issues such as  1. Land purpotedly bought by a donor for people to be ressettled  2. land allocated to people by cooperatives  3. land allocated to people by private developers  4. state land allocated by the ministry of local government.
							3

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Mechanism	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
2. Water, sanitation, fuel	Lack of water supply Non repair of leakages and pipeline breaks  Use of borehole water, long queues at the boreholes (HT)  Borehole water used for domestic purposes. Contaminated borehole water from sewage  Gardens placed near the so called "sewage river"  Lack of electrical power for cooking, lighting heating  Lack of ability of the ill ,elderly and disabled to fetch water from the alternative sources  Poor provision of sanitation, unsuitable designs risky to children	Individuals try to get as much water as possible for as long as possible  Toilets are used and only flushed when there is water, if there ever is.  Makeshift toilets connected to sewer lines.  Budget water so that each family member uses as little as possible (4-5I per day)  Use surrounding bush where available as toilets  Use of plastics, firewood and any flammable items.  Women fetch firewood for domestic use and they usually have to do it in the middle of the night for fear of being arrested and men do it	Absence of adequete water  Women and girls face the risk of sexual predation when collecting firewood and water in the odd hours of the night.  Increased deforestation  Health risks from air pollution,  Environmental degradation  Danger of fire outbreaks  Risks of diarrheal diseases	Urban Councils Acts Water-shedding policy ;developmental plans for piped water scheme  GAPS Lack of local power generation?  EMA not evident in towns	Power ,water and sanitation infrastructure not changed despite the increase in population	S51 Right to human dignity  S52(a)Right to personal security, freedom from all forms of violence from public and private sources  S57 Right to privacy.  S73, environmental rights,  S77, right to food and water	Self water purchase?  Ruralization / privatization of urban areas?
		for sale.					4

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Mechanism	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
2. (Continued) Water, sanitation, fuel	No toilets in areas of Hatcliffe.  In Mbare there are too many people for far too few toilets.  Toilet blocks outside – women and girls fear attacks  Lack of water for flushing, consequent blockages. (MB)  Inhaling dangerous and toxic emissions from various flammable items e.g. burning plastic for cooking  Increased domestic chores for women and girls – reduces time for school work and productive work.	People in Mbare use the water in Mukuvisi for bathing and washing clothes.  In Hatcliffe people have had to dig wells close to the "sewage river"  Disporsal of sanitary wear is opportunistic and they are often left in toilets.					

	Individuals	mechanisms	Inclusive Cities Implications	policies and evident gaps	continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
3. City infrastructure and services Roads Street lighting Garbage/refuse collection Transport Accessibility (disabilities, Age, gender etc.)	The flats are not being maintained any more, no servicing, no fumigation, no garbage collection.  No major maintenance work is being done  the pipes from the ablution facilities are worn out from rust.  Multiple burst water pipes.  There are no street lights and the tower light have since stopped working  The roads that once had tar now have either patches of tar and potholes or there is no tar to talk about anymore  There are piles of rubbish in the area (MB)	Because of the bad street lighting people try not to move around in the dark although it is almost impossible to avoid.  Many who work in industries/town have to walk/cycle to work as they can not pay for transport. They have to start walking very early and get back home when it is already dark  The disabled require an assistant	Dilapidated infrastructure is dangerous for residents especially women ,disabled persons and the elderly  Bad roads make it difficult to access the houses in cases of emergencies and the disabled find it difficulty to negotiate the roads  Dark spots are dangerous for women and increase chances of robbery and sexual assaults.  Citizens feel excluded  Public transport is too expensive for the residents who have had to resort to walking to work  Transport expensive because of high maintenance costs of vehicles.	Urban Councils Act and by laws. Disabled Persons Act.  GAPS  No ramps for public transport	Continuity and lack of response to need	S83 Rights of persons with disabilities (a) (b) and (c)  S56 Equality and non discrimination  s22 Persons with disability in particular (3) (b), (4)  S51 Right to human dignity,  S 52(a)Right to personal security, freedom from all forms of violence from public and private sources,  S57 Right to privacy.  S73 Environmental rights	People asked or revert to self help in respect of rep airing the infratructure.

**Evidence of** 

Frameworks for

Audience

Coping

**Exclusions** 

Impact on

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping mechanisms	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
3. (Continued) City infrastructure and services Roads Street lighting Garbage/refuse collection Transport Accessibility (disabilities, age, gender etc.)	Inaccessibility of roads means the commuter vehicles drop off people on the periphery of suburbs (HT)  High transport costs after hours to avoid security risks (HT)  Security risks, high accident rates on the roads at night  Individuals taking on the role of government and council to provide services  Women and girls mobility severely constrained  Women and girls especially vulnerable to security risks and gender based violence (GBV)		Those with cars and run businesses who complained that all are in poor condition because of poor roadspotholes				7

	Individuals	Strategies	Inclusive Cities Implications	policies and evident gaps	continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
4. Basic survival needs: Livelihoods Income generation options Urban agriculture Food security for families Basic subsistence needs? Markets and access to exchange and products	Loss/lack of employment  Reduced living standard/poverty  Most income generation options are targeted on rural residents excluding urban populations. Available options are not suitable for city based residents  Some women forced to engage in prostitution  Loss of leisure time due to pressure to improve income opportunities  Male out migration for economic reasonsfragmentation of families  Children left to cope alone or placed with relatives - child abuse may result	Vending (buying & selling) often officially unlawfully  Children doing the vending and gambling.  Economic migration  Substance abuse  Thefts, robbery, pick pocketting, gambling.  Urban farming  Buying food in small quantities (increase prices as there is no economy of scale)  Shabeens and brothels as a way of making a living.  Women and girls resort to sex work and transactional sex to gain benefits.	Security concerns as a result of urban agriculture and access to plots  Increase in crime as a result of limited income generation options  Continuing development of a criminal underclass.  Domestic violence (slide 10)  Green belts disappearing  People feel economically excluded	Urban Council Act and by – laws, Economic policies , National gender policy 2013 – 17. Small to Medium Enterprises Act  GAPS  Loans /training needed to initiate entrepreneurial activities  Current policies not being implemented  Revive industries	No new job creation and low retention of current jobs  Retrogression rather than proactive change	S 13 objective on national development.  S14 National objective on empowerment and employment creation,  S15 National objective on food security,  S18 (1) Fair regional representation (2)National objective on practical measures to ensure that all local communities have equitable access to recourses to promote their development  S32 National objective on recreational activities  S77 right to food and water  S81 Rights of children (e) protection from economic and sexual exploitation. S83 on the disabled to enable them to become self reliant	8

**Evidence of** 

Frameworks for

Audience

Impact on

**Exclusions** 

Coping

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Strategies	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
4. (Continued) Basic survival needs: Livelihoods Income generation options Urban agriculture Food security for families Basic subsistence needs? Markets and access to exchange and products	Market stalls are expensive and controlled by a select few.  Loss of self esteem  Food and income shortage  decrease in health status (slide 7)						

	Individuals	mechanisms	Inclusive Cities Implications	policies and evident gaps	continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
5. Economic advancement opportunities: Employment Industries Access to resources Professions/ Occupations and opportunities	Loss of jobs due to closure of some industries  Lack of income leads to unofficial lending schemes which can lead to credit crisis spiral  Loan sharking - chimbadzo  Even if you are qualified/skilled for a profession or occupation there are no jobs  Fragmentation of families seeking employment e.g. teachers not being able to teach at the same school with spouse  Feeling of worthlessness – loss of dignity due to lack of employment	Self employment Buying and selling Increase in cross border trading Substance abuse More domestic violence especially if the woman is working and the man is not Informal lending schemes Briefcase professional businesses and rent a chair in other offices People work for sub minimum wages Leave the country Follow the job market Resort to risky and illegal activities	Increased exclusion from the employment sector  Fragmented families	Economic policies, Indigenization and Economic Empowerment Act  GAPS  Impact limited. (people have heard about indigenisation and government loans but they have no idea how to get them)  Lack of implementation of policies and laws  Labor law but you need to be employed  Gaps after training no job	Further decay in formal employment sector  Low production levels in industry  More lay offs than employment creation  Despite the Domestic Violence Act and other progressive legislation the economic decay leads to tension, criminality and family violence  Retrogression rather than change  No change there are more trained professionals but may not secure jobs	S 13 objective on national development.  S14 National objective on empowerment and employment creation,  S15 National objective on food security,  S18 (2) National objective on practical measures to ensure that all local communities have equitable access to recourses to promote their development .  S25 National objective on protection of the family  S51 Right to Dignity,  S64 freedom of profession, trade or occupation	10

Evidence of

Frameworks for

Audience

Exclusions

Coping

Impact on

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Strategies	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
6. Education – access to – Basic education Pre school education Primary education High School Tertiary Adult Education Further education	There is a perception that children both boys and girls are "dropping out" in school There are no functional safety nets for children whose parents are struggling to meet the costs of education  Children not attaining adequate educational levels for future life  Apparent lack of suitable educational opportunities or facilities for children with disabilities  Pre schools are expensive and there is no after school child care. Pre schooling is not government supported with the exception of grade zero classes which are limited  In some parts of Hetcliffe it is a long commute to	Sending children to family members in rural areas for cheaper educational opportunities	General decline in the quality and appropriateness of education  Ultimately lack of education leads to general economic decline and lack of initiative  Children at risk of sexual predation especially girl children commuting to and from school.	Education Act S (4), (5) and (6)  BEAM.  Council policies and resolutions on assisting the vulnerable  GAPS  Policies are there for sound education but lack of resources and measures to maintain standards are lacking  The lack of comprehensive development plans for Hatcliffe means there is inadequate provision for education and other facilities	Quality education may be inaccessible  Retrogression rather than change	S27 national objective on education,  S22 National objective on persons with disabilities  S 75 Right to education(1) (a basic and state funded including adult basic education, b further education must be progressively available)  S81Rights of children (e) protection from economic and sexual exploitation) (f) to education, health care, nutrition and shelter  S83 right of persons with disabilities. Right to state funded education	What is being done in further education?  What is the situation regarding pre schooling in suburbs like Mbare and Hatcliffe.
	reach an affordable and appropriate school.						11

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping mechanisms	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
7 Health Basic and Primary Health needs: Maternal health Ante natal and post natal services Delivery services Immunization	\$ 25 maternity and child health fee is low but may still be prohibitive for some women as well as the \$5 for consultation at clinics  Can not afford prescription drugs  Poor health  Unaffordable ambulance costs which should be paid upfront.	Use of traditional healers and prophets  Abuse of pain killers as an alternative to required medication  Communities may assist financially when there is need.  Women have resorted to the use of traditional midwives as an alternative because they have payment plans and payment in kind ( in Hatcliffe the traditional midwife charges a bar of washing soap, a tablet of bathing soap and \$15)	Failure to address basic health needs leads to escalation in severity of problems and ultimately increases both social and economic costs  Alternative medicine from traditional and faith healers  More exclusion no money to pay medical treatment or access to appropriate facilities	Health Act and National Health policy. Council by- laws on health and council resolutions on the vulnerable  GAPS  10% of Zimbabwean population on health insurance. There are however problems of shortfalls.	Facilities and capacity to cope with health needs of poor members of the communities remain static/problematic  Retrogression rather than proactive change  Clinics and maternity delivery services are overwhelmed.	S29 National objective on health services.  30 National objective on social welfare,  S48(1) right to life  S76 Right to health care - The obligation to provide emergency medical treatment	There is need to explore the interpretation of emergency medical treatment.

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping Mechanisms	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
8. Health Diagnostic services Advanced care services Medicines Access to health services Cost Proximity Availability	Referrals from local clinics to provincial hospitals requires additional payment – thus can not afford sophisticated treatments and additional costs  People do not follow up on referrals  Lack of access to referral facilities because of cost. Individuals unable to afford proper thorough diagnosis of illnesses.  Advanced diagnostic services/ tools not affordable e.g. scans blood tests – maybe referred to private specialists/ South Africa	Essentially self or community generated assistance  Patients provide required medication and treatment paraphernalia e g gloves needles and bandages.	Failure to adequately deal with diseases requiring high level of diagnostic skills and equipment  Caring obligations fall on women whose productive and employment capacities may be adversely affected.	Health Act and National Health policies.  Council by - laws on health and council resolutions on the vulnerable  GAPS  The referral chains have broken down.	There is increased exclusion and lack of essential health services for all	S29 National objective on health services.  30 National objective on social welfare,  S48(1) right to life  S76 (2)Right to health care for chronic illnesses.  S82 (b) the right to health care from the state for those over 70 years of age.  s83	Child headed households and management of medical issues?  S 76 of the Constitution -: definition of basic health care services?  definition of chronic illness?  What is one entitled to under section 76 in terms of health care  What is the basis for exemption from payment of hospital fees.

9. Legal and administrative administrative justice, access to law; impartial dispute resolution processes  Proximity, accessibility, cost  In criminal cases people do not want to be witnesses as that would require them to go to court several times. If one has to travel to court more that two/t three time it becomes to expensive in terms of leaving their market stalls.  Money required to process claims like the messenger of court fees and court fees are far beyond the		Impact on Individuals	Coping strategies	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
	administrative justice, access to law; impartial dispute resolution processes Proximity, accessibility, cost	for people with money especially when dealing with civil cases and deceased estates.  Maintenance and DV cases well handled but it depends on who is presiding.  The rate at which cases are dealt with is very slow.  In criminal cases people do not want to be witnesses as that would require them to go to court several times.  If one has to travel to court more that two/ three time it becomes too expensive in terms of leaving their market stalls.  Money required to process claims like the messenger of court fees and court	people bribe the police and court officials to get their cases processed Resort to self help –	alleged at lower levels  Cases go unreported or matters are not reported  Increase in crime as culprits are not apprehended  Cases are not concluded because of lack of witnesses  Inequalities and exclusion of the poor  Court process are alienating for most	and Client charter.  Magistrates, High Court Acts and Rules  Domestic Violence Act S 5- role of police  GAPS  Lack of knowledge of the law,  Lack of implementation either due to lack of political will or resources . Lack of accountability.	and administration of	legal Aid  S62 Access to information  S69 Right to fair hearing (3) every person has the right to access the courts  Will and inheritance campaign under the Ministry of Justice could	Human Rights Commission?  Gender Commission?  Current status of legal aid and legal education <i>pro</i>

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping strategies	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions – reason for the workshop
9. (Continued ) Legal and administrative justice, access to law; impartial dispute resolution processes Proximity, accessibility, cost	People do not know or understand court procedures so can not act without assistance  Lawyers are expensive.  There is nowhere where the general populace are taught simple legal procedures for example registering and administering an estate.  Whenever they report their cases the police do not take them seriously. At times the police will tell them to go back and get the person who would have wronged them and bring them to the police. Or they will just say they have no staff or vehicle to attend to the matter						

Exclusions	Impact on Individuals	Coping strategies	Safe and Inclusive Cities Implications	Current laws, policies and evident gaps	Evidence of continuities – change or no change in response to population dynamics	Frameworks for Inclusion Declaration of Rights and the National Objectives – 2013 Constitution	Audience Comments and additions — reason for the workshop
10 . Violence as a source of exclusion – GBV, DV, theft robbery, muggings	Domestic violence applications quite heavily utilized  Women entrepreneurs at risk of having goods/money stolen when going to purchase goods fro resale	Protection orders  Gates and walls wherever feasible (HT)  Development of police posts within communities.	Lack of recreational facilities and employment leads to anti social behaviour e.g. gangs, heavy drinking, harassment of women and girls – restricts female mobility and sense of security  Individuals taking the law into their own hands  Mobility problems for disabled – fear attacks	Police Client Charters and Standing Orders need to adhered to and need to brought into line with S50.  GAPS  Enforcement of laws problematic.  Police expectations of complainants to effect enforcement  Continuance of gender stereotyping and social norms adverse to women attainment of rights	There is continued high levels of violence.	S25 (b) prevention of domestic violence.  S51 Right to human dignity,  S52(a)Right to personal security, freedom from all forms of violence from public and private sources,  S53 freedom from torture or inhuman and degrading treatment  S50 the right of arrested and detained persons	We are still working on whether there is and what is the nature of the correlation between poverty, poor living conditions and violence.